



**COMMUNITY ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM (CAMP)
OUTREACH COMMITTEE**

**REGULAR MEETING
Wednesday, February 24, 2021, 6:00 PM
Minutes**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was held virtually using Zoom and called to order by Vice Chair Allen at 6:01 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Committee Members Vice Chair Donna Allen
Dawn Argula
Steven Dunbar
Mark Palajac
Steve Stamos
Marco Torres
Nicol Williams-Pruitt
Jennifer Yeamans

Staff Present Debbie Bell, Management Analyst II
Kathy Hughes, Administrative Assistant
Scott Lanphier, Public Works Director
Bob Vinn, Acting City Engineer
Helen Ling, Water Resources Division Manager
Natalie Croak, WR Communications Representative
Tara Mazzanti, Assistant City Attorney
Uyiosa Oviawe, Asset Management Specialist

Tim Carroll, MIG
Noé Noyola, MIG

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

Vice Chair Allen asked Staff Liaison Debbie Bell to explain the public comments process for the meeting. Ms. Bell explained that the meeting was taking place using the Zoom platform and being conducted pursuant to provisions of the

Brown Act and recent Executive Orders by the Governor to facilitate teleconferencing to reduce the risk of COVID-19 transmission at public meetings. An opportunity for public comments would be provided for each agenda item. Comments were to be submitted using the Zoom Q&A feature. Comments using the Chat feature would not be accepted. Comments were limited to one per person for each agenda item. Each comment should begin with the agenda item number and were limited to no more than 500 words. She explained that if more than one comment was submitted by a single person for a single item, only the last statement would be read into the record. The public comment period for each item would end when the Chair closes the comment period, and no additional comments would be read for that item.

There were no public comments for items not on the agenda.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

ON A MOTION BY COMMITTEE MEMBER ARGULA, SECONDED BY COMMITTEE MEMBER STAMOS, CARRIED ON A 7-0 VOTE, WITH COMMITTEE MEMBER YEAMANS ABSTAINING DUE TO ABSENCE, THE OCTOBER 28, 2020 MINUTES WERE APPROVED AS SUBMITTED.

5. REPORT ON OLD BUSINESS

There was no old business to discuss, and no public comments for this agenda item.

6. NEW BUSINESS

Debbie Bell started by reviewing 2020 accomplishments. The City hired MIG consultants to assist with public outreach and created the CAMP Outreach Committee which has met five times to date. Staff, MIG, and the CAMP Outreach Committee developed a communications strategy and brand identity, improved the www.LivermoreAssets.net website, conducted a community survey that received over 1,000 responses, conducted online quizzes, produced digital newsletters, created an ongoing asset geocache activity, updated Council numerous times on the public outreach process, and will be working on many more outreach tools.

Ms. Bell explained there has been significant progress over the last year improving the City's asset management technology. We've entered into an agreement with NEXGEN, a workflow management software system that will help with asset lifecycle planning, risk analysis, and capital project prioritization. The City is procuring mobile devices to help field staff with analysis and more efficient data collection. The City also hired an Asset Management Specialist who

is working on developing new workflow and business practices to help make more informed decisions.

6.01 **Election of Chairperson and Vice Chairperson**

Ms. Bell reminded members that there is now a vacancy on the CAMP Outreach Committee due to the departure of Chair Regina Bonanno, who is now serving on the City Council. She asked members to encourage others to apply for this vacancy by Friday, February 26, 2021.

Ms. Bell turned to meeting back to Vice Chair Allen for the election of officers.

Vice Chair Allen opened the item for public comment. There was no public comment on the item. Vice Chair Allen closed the item to public comments.

ON A MOTION BY COMMITTEE MEMBER YEAMANS, SECONDED BY COMMITTEE MEMBER DUNBAR, CARRIED ON AN 8-0 VOTE, VICE CHAIR ALLEN WAS ELECTED CHAIR.

ON A MOTION BY COMMITTEE MEMBER YEAMANS, SECONDED BY COMMITTEE MEMBER ARGULA, CARRIED ON AN 8-0 VOTE, COMMITTEE MEMBER YEAMANS WAS ELECTED AS VICE CHAIR.

6.02 **Report from CAMP Outreach Members**

Debbie Bell reminded committee members that they are instrumental to the success of the program and have provided significant input to steer and improve the outreach efforts. She emphasized their job is to make sure the City's messages are kept at a level that are understandable and relatable to the public. As a focus group they help confirm the approach, methods, messages, and example projects for the outreach campaign. They are program ambassadors and the City needs their help sharing outreach messages with their respective service organizations, interest groups, social media contacts, friends, and family. They've done an excellent job of providing feedback, not just at the meetings but also when approached individually with questions.

Chair Allen opened the item up for public comments. There were none, and the item was closed to public comments.

Ms. Bell asked committee members to give an "eyes on the ground" report of what they are hearing about Asset Management on social media, from attending other meetings, by reading letters to the editor in the newspapers, or any other sources. This information will help with the feedback loop and determine if we need to adjust or adapt the messaging, tone, or level of detail to better resonate with the community.

Committee member Argula said that she is the CEO of the Livermore Valley Chamber of Commerce, and she has posted information about the geocache and CAMP on different platforms and would welcome a presentation at an upcoming Chamber meeting. She noted that she's seen some misinformation circulating about the Airport and said it's not uncommon. She said the Airport is an incredible asset for the City because not all cities have their own airports, and she thinks more work can be done to focus on the Airport assets.

Committee member Dunbar said he's been investigating park ownership between the City and LARPD. He's also researching park maintenance responsibilities and found it interesting that some are maintained by one entity but owned by the other.

Debbie Bell said that she is working on a Parks and Plazas Asset Management plan which should be available in the near future. It will delineate ownership versus maintenance responsibilities. She warned that it might not be 100% accurate, as it is challenging to identify.

Bob Vinn let Committee member Dunbar know that Engineering maintains a map and spreadsheet with the park information in case he hadn't yet seen it. Committee member Dunbar said he thought he'd run across it in his research.

Committee member Palajac reminded the Committee that he has a recap of all the parks and associated assets that are the responsibility of LARPD.

Committee member Stamos mentioned that the new pedestrian overcrossing at Murrieta Boulevard opened since the last meeting and he thinks it's a great addition to the City because it provides connections to the Iron Horse Trail. He'd like to see the asset stay in good shape for future users.

Vice Chair Yeamans mentioned that as a parent of school aged children, she's heard rave reviews for the geocache activity. She said it was timed well for the downtime during the December holidays. Regarding the talking points, she asked for clarification on what was meant by "Equity Communities?" She asked if it was something we were trying to characterize as inclusive engagement, and that she didn't understand labeling a community as an equity community. Ms. Bell said it can mean a few things, but what we are aiming for is inclusive outreach so that we are reaching as many sectors of our community as possible.

Chair Allen said that she had also heard good things about the geocache game and said that some of her neighbors participated and said they learned a lot about the City. She also said that she's heard good comments about Asset Management through Next Door and Facebook.

Ms. Bell thanked the Committee members for their comments and reminded them that as they hear things in the future, to write them down so they can be shared at the next meeting.

6.03 **Discussion Regarding Asset Management Outreach Program Updates**

Debbie Bell brought the Committee up to date on what has happened since the last meeting in October 2020. A Citywide newsletter was mailed in November 2020 that included an article on Asset Management. This article introduced the general topic of Asset Management and introduced people to the website. Another Citywide newsletter will be sent in March 2021. For this one, Ms. Bell plans to write an article about the geocache activity and again try to draw people to the website where the video will be available. She said she's also sent multiple Asset Management newsletters through Constant Contact to the 1,000 plus email addresses to inform them of the latest educational tools (i.e. the survey results and the geocache game), announcing each of our CAMP meetings, and advertising the recruitment for the open CAMP Committee position. She's also updating the website by including asset quantities and values and adding supporting documentation for City building assets. She asked the Committee to keep giving feedback and suggestions for edits on the website.

Ms. Bell then updated the Committee on the geocache activity. She explained over 600 people have participated from all age groups, including many families. Over 50 of the participants have been between the ages of 13 and 29, which is an age group that is not usually involved in these types of activities. There have been 150 participants over the age of 40. There have been families with young children and it's fun for the kids and educational for the parents. We have heard from people that they are learning a lot about parts of the City that they either didn't know existed, or they knew existed but didn't know anything about. They commented that they appreciated that it was a COVID safe activity that got them out of their houses. She thanked the Committee for their feedback and suggestions at a previous CAMP meetings, saying that many of their suggestions were incorporated into the activity and instructions. The deadline for the geocache activity has been extended through the end of winter.

Ms. Bell said that the geocache is an excellent example of how we pivoted our outreach program over the course of the last year due to COVID constraints. We had originally planned to do most of our outreach in person, with a small subset of our effort scoped for online activities. Instead we quickly transitioned to more of an online outreach effort. We've bolstered the website, developed online educational tools including Facebook quizzes, and created much more social media messaging than we anticipated.

Ms. Bell said that our overall outreach effort is scheduled to end December 2021 but believes that is too soon. She recommends extending and expanding the

outreach program, and our contract with MIG for an additional year, through December 2022. She also recommends extending the CAMP Outreach Committee term limits through December 2022. She asked the committee members for their comments.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were none, and the item was closed for public comments. Chair Allen opened the item up for questions and comments from the committee.

Vice Chair Yeamans thought overall the recommendations make sense. She mentioned that Council was going to be setting their priorities soon, and she knows asset management is one of the options and she wondered how it will influence what happens next in the program. Ms. Bell said that while we are hoping they choose asset management as a Council priority, it doesn't affect whether we can extend the program timeframe.

Committee member Dunbar said he was fine with the term extension. He asked if there was a limit on how long the geocache activity could last, as he feels it would be good to have it available as we continue with in person meetings. He also asked how to integrate efforts with the Climate Action Plan and General Plan Update. Ms. Bell agreed it would be helpful to have the geocache available when we go back to in person meetings. As for integrating our message with other plans that are happening right now, Ms. Bell said she is working directly with Climate Action Plan and General Plan Update staff. They have discussed having an opportunity at each meeting to "cross pollinate" to show how climate change, asset management, and the General Plan are interrelated. She said she's willing to work with members to brainstorm how to bring that discussion to a community level.

Committee member Palajac said he was fine with extending the term limits. He said that since we want to continue, it means we haven't achieved our goals. He asked what success would look like, and how do we know when we get there? Ms. Bell said the goal is to do as much broad education as possible before we survey the community to ask for asset funding priorities. After a final report to Council, there will be ongoing outreach make sure we emphasize the importance of infrastructure and asset management efforts. Committee member Palajac said he thought it would be helpful to provide as much information on the Airport as possible, especially now that there will be a new fixed based operator and they will be providing charter services. He knows some people are concerned about noise, but it will bring a huge increase in tax revenue for the City, so it would behoove us to provide as much information as possible to the residents.

Committee member Torres agreed it would be helpful to have a common voice to present the facts. He thinks if it does pass, it would be a great thing for the community.

Committee member Argula said that as long as the city has assets, there should be public outreach to support efforts to maintain them. She said hopefully there is a long-term plan to develop factual information people can refer to when they want to know about assets. She's in favor of extending the term limits and said there is a lot of work still to be done.

Public Works Director Scott Lanphier said regarding the airport the proposed Kaiser plan has not been approved and is in the review process. He reminded the Committee that the Airport is an Enterprise Fund asset and that it's supported by federal and enterprise funds, and not the City's general fund. Similarly, he reminded the Committee that the Water Resource Plant is also an Enterprise Fund asset.

6.04 **Discussion Regarding Asset Management Animated Video –**

Consultant Tim Carroll from MIG introduced the Asset Management 3-minute animated video to the Committee. He reminded the Committee that they provided significant input on this video; the initial concept was presented at the August 2020 meeting and based on the Committee's feedback, the storyboard and draft script was presented at the October 2020 meeting. The goals of the video are to educate viewers about asset management and raise awareness that there are difficult decisions to be made because of lack of funding. This video will supplement and support our other outreach efforts. The video will be evergreen, something that can be used in a multi-year timeframe so that it can last for a while. Mr. Carroll said that MIG developed a visual style that's friendly and familiar but not overly casual. Mr. Carroll then played the video for the Committee. He said the video will be distributed via social media, the website, stakeholder presentations, and provided as an educational tool for schools. He said there was some discussion at a previous meeting about potentially broadcasting it in some pro bono capacity, and he'd like to hear suggestions from the Committee on that.

Chair Allen opened the item up for public comments. There were none, and the item was closed for public comments.

Mr. Carroll then asked the Committee for feedback on the video. He asked if it was effective in getting the message across, and whether there was any way to improve the process for future creative efforts.

Committee member Stamos thinks the video is great, and the visuals and imagery went well with the talking points. He said the background music was too loud and distracting from the messaging and asked if it could be turned down. Mr. Carroll said they could lower the volume for the music.

Committee member Torres said he liked the video it and the message it conveyed. He would like to see more videos that dig deeper into asset management. He said he feels people can learn a lot from them, and maybe to one day have a library of videos on different assets.

Committee member Dunbar said he thought the video came together nicely. He mentioned that in the future, a better way to bring up state and federal requirements would be to have a pop-up bubble that will say exactly what they are telling us needs to be done. In terms of distribution he suggested having a QR code downtown that would link to the video, and maybe having it at the end of the geocache as well.

Bob Vinn suggested airing the video on TV30.

Chair Allen asked the Committee to send any additional thoughts or suggestions to Debbie Bell.

6.05 **Discussion Regarding Asset Management Fact Sheets**

Debbie Bell opened this discussion by explaining the original scope of work for the outreach project included the creation of one fact sheet to provide a general overview of the Asset Management Program. However, through feedback over the last year, they realized there is also a need to create fact sheets for each asset class.

Mr. Carroll presented the Committee with a template fact sheet for Public Buildings. He explained the various sections of the sheet, starting with a general introduction and definition of the asset. The “Quick Facts” section provides the number, cost to replace and repair, and the asset health grade. The fact sheet also includes pictures of the specified assets and their purpose, risk analysis, current level of risk by cost, catch up and keep up definitions and grades, and a call to action with a link to the website.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were none, and the item was closed to public comments.

Mr. Carroll asked the Committee for their comments on the fact sheet design and layout, if the content is useful, if the level of detail is appropriate, and if they had any distribution suggestions.

Committee member Palajac suggested that staff send the sample fact sheets out to the Committee so they can spend time looking them over. Ms. Bell said she will send the draft fact sheet to the committee members via email for more detailed review.

Committee member Dunbar thought that the level of detail was fairly high and might need to come down a bit. He asked what the intended goal of the fact sheet was, and whether we should be prompting the reader to think about what we want (in terms of the end of program survey) or just present the facts so as not to influence the survey. Mr. Carroll said they would need to keep that in mind and be cognizant of the influence the content might have.

Chair Allen thought the fact sheets could be used on social media as informational cues for our community. By posting the fact sheets every so often and providing the website address it would increase awareness and traffic to the website.

Ms. Bell thanked the Committee for their ideas. She said the intention of a serial release will allow asset management to remain a hot topic without being intrusive.

6.06 **Discussion Regarding Asset Management Stakeholder Briefings**

Debbie Bell reminded the Committee that at their first few meetings Committee members agreed that part of their role and responsibility was to take the message of asset management out to their contacts. She introduced the draft Stakeholder Briefing PowerPoint and asked the Committee provide input on the content level, detail, and tone.

Noé Noyola explained that the presentation is intended to be used to engage the public through community members and trusted sources. It will amplify the effort and message beyond City staff and help obtain unvarnished feedback. He asked that the Committee consider if the presentation will work for them as ambassadors of the program. He then presented the briefing to the Committee as if he was speaking as one of them and presenting to a gathering of residents.

He started by explaining the presentation goals are to educate and build awareness and understanding of the City's infrastructure needs. He explained what an asset is and gave an overview of City owned assets, and said he would focus on general fund assets, rather than enterprise fund assets that are not paid for out of the general fund. He went over the impacts of asset management to the general fund, saying that there isn't enough money to fully fund infrastructure repair and replacement each year. He explained the potential options and solutions to this dilemma. He went over Livermore's approach and emerging issues. He explained asset priorities, frequency of use, and funding strategies. The presentation then transitions to showing the video and interacting with the audience by asking participants share their top asset priorities and preferred long-term solutions. At the end of the presentation members should thank the participants for their involvement, ask them to attend future CAMP meetings, mention the website for more information, ask them to share the video with their networks, and ask them to sign up for email updates.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were none, and the item was closed for public comments.

Mr. Noyola asked the Committee for input on the mock presentation.

Committee member Argula said she thought the presentation was headed in the right direction but that it was a lot of information and she would like the opportunity to have more time to go over it before commenting. She said she could see that it would prompt a lot of questions and might need to be paired down. She said we would want to make sure that tools are connected regarding the language and the references that are used to avoid confusion.

Committee member Stamos said that while the Committee might be comfortable with the information in the presentation, it might be in the weeds for the general public. He said the simpler it is kept in terms of the graphics and the message the

better it will be. He thought it would be helpful to have all this information, but it would really depend on the venue. He also thinks it would be helpful to put asset management into context of how Livermore is ahead of the curve on other cities in this regard. Mr. Noyola agreed that it is important to recognize how Livermore is being proactive. He said that judging by the feedback, the presentation will need to strike a balance between being accessible to the most people, but also have more information for those people that will ask more difficult questions.

Vice Chair Yeamans agrees with the other members that while it's good information it is too much to hold the audience's attention. She said that different versions would be helpful but that overall it should be kept high level and visual, as some people are visual thinkers. She also thinks there should be a clear call to action for the audience by giving them suggestions on how to be involved.

Chair Allen said she thinks it would be beneficial to start the outreach on a smaller scale, perhaps at a Farmer's Market, so that we can get better feedback.

Ms. Bell said that the plan is to attend a Farmer's Market in the next few months to keep the momentum going. She said once the presentation is finalized and the Committee is comfortable with it, we will ask them to present it virtually to their groups and once we are able, to present it in person.

Committee member Dunbar said he wasn't sure giving the results of the feedback we've already had is necessary and he thinks we should be more focused on what the options are that we want people to give them. He felt that asking people to prioritize solutions when they've only been given limited information might not be enough to prompt them to give suggestions. He also felt that the functionality of the PowerPoint could be off given that you'd have to flip back and forth to get them to understand some of the options.

Ms. Bell said that the primary objective of the presentation is to lay the base foundation of information for our community and let them know that we will be asking for their priorities so they need to start thinking about them now as a precursor to their official opportunity via a survey that will happen down the line.

She said they could continue the conversation via email and she would bring them the next draft at the next CAMP meeting.

6.07 **Discussion Regarding Asset Management Upcoming Outreach Tools and Next Steps**

Debbie Bell went through the next steps for outreach.

- Launch the video
- Continue to broaden reach and promote online engagement activities via social media
- Create City newsletter article for Spring 2021
- Work on Asset Fact Sheets

- Move forward on virtual briefings
- Work on Youth Engagement
- Create Interactive Game

Ms. Bell told the Committee that she anticipates having the next meeting in April or May 2021.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were none, and the item was closed for public comments.

7. ADJOURNMENT

THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 8:02 P.M. TO THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING TO BE HELD AT A FUTURE DATE, TIME, AND LOCATION TO BE DETERMINED.