



**COMMUNITY ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM COMMITTEE
(CAMP)**

**SPECIAL MEETING
CIVIC CENTER LIBRARY
1188 S. LIVERMORE AVENUE
6:00 p.m.**

**Wednesday, October 30, 2019
Minutes**

This is the last regularly scheduled CAMP Committee meeting. The CAMP Committee dissolves upon the City Council’s approval of the formation of the CAMP Outreach Committee at the November 25, 2019 Council Meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Susan Frost at 6:02 p.m. at the Civic Center Library, 1188 S. Livermore Avenue, Livermore, California.

2. ROLL CALL

Committee Members Chair Susan Frost
 Regina Bonanno
 Jennifer Estridge
 Jan Evans
 Gordon Jones
 Jennifer Yeamans

Absent Vice Chair Bob Dashner
 Paul Foster

Staff Present Ms. Debbie Bell – Management Analyst II
 Scott Lanphier – Public Works Director
 Cheri Sheets – City Engineer
 Anthony Smith – Management Analyst II
 Kathy Hughes – Administrative Assistant

3. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Nothing to report.

4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

ON A MOTION BY MEMBER BONANNO, SECONDED BY MEMBER YEAMANS, CARRIED ON A 6-0 VOTE, THE MARCH 27, 2019 MINUTES WERE APPROVED AS SUBMITTED.

5. **NEW BUSINESS**

- 5.01 **Stormwater Update** – Management Analyst Anthony Smith gave a presentation on Stormwater infrastructure in anticipation of a similar presentation scheduled for the November 25, 2019 Council meeting. He provided an overview of what assets the system includes and then briefed the committee on the regulatory requirements. He said that the City spends approximately \$900,000 per year on compliance with Federal and State regulations.

Mr. Smith then spoke about the operation and maintenance of storm drains and streams. He told the committee that the City currently does only reactive maintenance at a combined cost of \$1,185,000 per year, but in order to maintain the system fully the City would need to spend a total of \$3.8 million a year. He then spoke about the asset replacement costs, telling the committee that the City currently spends approximately \$50,000 a year on replacement, but that staff estimates \$8.5 million per year for “full service.”

Mr. Smith then said that the City currently generates \$1 million per year through a stormwater parcel tax, but is expending \$2.3 million per year. The full service combination of regulatory compliance, operations and maintenance, and asset replacement would require a total of \$13.2 million per year, making the yearly deficit \$12.2 million.

Mr. Smith then presented potential policy options that Council could consider, including the following:

- Regionalizing streams and partnering with Zone 7 and other agencies
- Seeking new revenue sources, including property-based fees, taxes or general fund subsidies
- Seeking state funding for regulatory compliance activities
- Evaluating service levels and their long-term impacts

Mr. Smith then asked for input from the committee. Committee member Yeamans asked if the \$13.2 million needed per year was just for operation and maintenance. Mr. Smith responded that that amount includes operation and maintenance, replacement costs and regulatory costs. Committee member

Bonanno recommended that the City make it clear that the amounts mentioned would cover the entire cost of replacement and upkeep. Committee member Jones suggested that the City show the residents just how bad the situation is and what could happen to the assets without additional funding. Chair Frost suggested mentioning what the consequences would be if we don't follow the state regulations. Committee member Bonanno said that placing a tax on property owners or state funding sounded like the best ideas. She felt that cutting service levels was too extreme, considering they are already low. Committee member Yeamans approved of the idea of seeking state funding and an additional property tax. Committee member Jones suggested re-wording the risk based assessments to "service level adequate" and list the different levels of service that would be possible.

- 5.02 **Asset Management Community Outreach Campaign** – CAMP Liaison
Debbie Bell informed the Committee that the City has completed a Request for Proposal (RFP) process for the Asset Management Outreach Campaign and chose MIG as the top consultant. She is planning to ask Council to approve the contract at the November 25, 2019 Council meeting.

Ms. Bell reminded the Committee that at three CAMP meetings in 2017 the Committee provided input that staff used to shape the Asset Management Outreach Program. These included drafting an education and engagement mission statement, brainstorming possible activities and methodologies, providing input on target audiences, and discussing CAMP's role in the program.

Staff took this information and drafted an RFP for the Asset Management Outreach Program. Five proposals were received, and after reviewing them, two companies were chosen to be interviewed, and MIG was selected. Based on input from the Committee Ms. Bell will now work on revising the scope of services for the agreement, with plans to take it to Council on November 25, 2019 for approval.

Ms. Bell reminded the Committee that the overall intent of the outreach campaign is to share infrastructure information with the community, and to solicit community feedback.

Staff will meet with MIG after we have them under agreement to put together a strategy and outreach plan. This will set the parameters for the outreach plan and guide the development of branding, activities, performance metrics, messages, materials, and schedule.

Based on the strategy and outreach plan, we will then begin working on various in-person and digital tools. The most critical element of this step will be to create a flexible tool kit with a briefing book, facts sheets, FAQ sheets, talking points, graphics, and materials.

Ms. Bell stressed that the materials will be easily reproduced and used for various venues (i.e. Farmer's Market, Wine Festival), and training will be provided to ambassadors who will speak about asset management to various stakeholders.

The in-person outreach will consist of meetings, booths at various events, and youth/kid friendly activities. The digital activities will include brand identity, a 3-5 minute educational video, web based interactive tools, newsletters and a social media campaign.

The outreach campaign will conclude with a key findings report. This report will summarize what we did, results of the campaign, lessons learned, feedback with community priorities, and feedback on potential policy options.

It is anticipated that the outreach campaign will last for most of 2020. During this time, Ms. Bell anticipates there will be four CAMP meetings. She then asked the Committee for input on the potential scope of services.

Committee member Evans asked if the public outreach campaign delays the decisions on sidewalks and street trees until after the campaign is finished. Ms. Bell said that there are currently no plans to bring sidewalks and street trees back to Council. Cheri Sheets mentioned in general there is poor communication in regards to what people are responsible to maintain. Committee member Evans said the campaign won't be successful without educating the residents. Committee member Bonanno said efforts should be directed to people who think they already pay enough in taxes for the maintenance of assets, as those will be the hardest sell. Committee member Estridge said it's going to boil down to what people have to pay for and whether they will be willing to pay more. Committee member Yeaman said we will need to get the consultant to Committee and follow through with creating an on-going outreach tool like a dashboard. Committee member Jones asked if the City was working on a better replacement tree list, as the one it currently has includes invasive trees. Ms. Bell said the Maintenance group is working to refine the list.

- 5.03 **Asset Management Update to the City Council** – Ms. Bell informed the Committee that staff plans to go to Council with an asset management update on November 25, 2019. This update will include an overview of recent asset management activities, a request to approve the public outreach contract with MIG, and a discussion about CAMP's term limits and objectives.

Ms. Bell plans to start the update by briefing Council on the asset management activities. She will remind Council that the contract with Kayuga was signed in 2015, and that the CAMP Committee was formed in 2016. CAMP has had 19 meetings to date. Staff has gone to Council six times and been directed by Council to proceed with a risk based priority approach for various assets.

Throughout the process, staff learned that the City has \$2.5 billion in general fund assets. It has also learned that these assets would need \$20-40 million a year in maintenance funds (depending on the service level), but that the City is only budgeting approximately \$10 million a year.

The report will also remind Council of the Asset Management accomplishments thus far. She noted that based on Council's direction, the Capital Improvement Budget now showcases for every funded project the dollars budgeted for expansion and enhancement contrasted with renewal and replacement – this allows us to see all the new things the City is building versus how much we are taking care of our existing items. It also highlights the gap between maintenance needs versus what is budgeted. This information helps reinforce the message that the City continues to need more funding to replace infrastructure over time.

The report will also remind Council that it adopted a risk-based approach to prioritize most of the City's asset classes. She will speak about the \$160,000 that Council approved at their October 14, 2019 meeting to build new access ramps in high pedestrian areas. She will update them on the Holmes Street Wall Replacement Pilot Project, and also how staff is creating a new business process for Stormwater system maintenance activities. She will also let them know about the progress being made on asset integration into Accela, IRIS and GIS. Ms. Bell will then brief Council on the next steps for asset management. These will include outreach, the continuation of asset data integration, pilot projects to reduce infrastructure maintenance needs, reviewing and adjusting business practices, and discussing the CAMP Committee term limits and next steps for the group.

Committee member Bonanno suggested that Ms. Bell stress that the data integration is a work in progress.

- 5.04 **CAMP Rules of Procedure/Term Limits** – Ms. Bell informed the Committee members that the City Clerk's office communicated concerns that the CAMP Committee members are working past their term limits and will advise the Council to start a new recruitment process at the November 25, 2019 Council meeting.

Ms. Bell explained that although CAMP has accomplished many goals, it is at a critical juncture as it moves from analyzing data to public outreach. Based on this, amendments to the CAMP Rules of Procedure (ROP) will be considered by the Council. The revised ROP will reflect CAMP's duties/responsibilities as a focus group for outreach efforts and as ambassadors who are willing to share the outreach message with their respective service organization, interest groups, and social media contacts.

Ms. Bell encouraged all CAMP members to reapply, and said that even if they don't, they would always have an open line of communication with her any time they want to discuss asset management. She also suggested that everyone

consider signing up to participate in the City's Keys to the City training program (<http://www.cityoflivermore.net/k2c.htm>).

Committee member Bonanno asked if Council would establish new term limits. Ms. Bell said they would, but that hasn't been determined yet. Committee member Yeamans thought that nine members worked well, and Council should stick with that number. Committee member Yeamans also suggested that if there are new members, the current members could update them on behalf of staff. Chair Frost said that members should be residents, and that Council should make sure to have at least one business owner as a representative on the Committee. Committee member Bonanno suggested listing the desired skills and experience, to get people with "built in" knowledge to apply. Chair Frost said staff should be careful with the wording. Committee member Evans suggested asking for people with a communications background. Committee member Jones suggested going paperless.

6. **ADJOURNMENT**

THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 7:55 PM. THE NEXT REGULAR CAMP MEETING WILL BE HELD AT A FUTURE DATE, TIME AND LOCATION TO BE DETERMINED BY THE CAMP COMMITTEE.